

**G20 Development Working Group (DWG)**  
**Human Resource Development Pillar**

**Progress Report**  
**ILO, OECD, UNESCO and the World Bank<sup>1</sup>**  
**3-5 May 2012**

Submitted to the G20 DWG meeting in Los Cabos, 3-5 May 2012

**Action 1: Create Internationally Comparable Skills Indicators**

**Action 2: Enhance National Employable Skills Strategies**



---

<sup>1</sup> This progress report was prepared by the ILO, in coordination with and based on inputs from the OECD, UNESCO and the World Bank.

## **G20 Development Working Group (DWG) Human Resource Development Pillar**

### Progress Report Submitted to the G20 DWG; Los Cabos, May 2012

1. This report summarizes progress in each major deliverable of the Human Resource Development pillar as agreed in the Multiyear Action Plan and subsequent meetings of the G20 Development Working Group. The list of deliverables includes work on skills for employment indicators, support to pilot countries to enhance skills policies, knowledge sharing, and skills for green growth.

#### **Action 1: Skills Indicators**

2. Since the third G20 DWG meeting in Paris on 18-20 September 2011, good progress has been made on Action 1 in two directions.
3. First, the draft interim report on skills indicators for employment and productivity in LICs by the OECD and the World Bank, in collaboration with the ILO and UNESCO, has been extensively reviewed by the IOs and a revised version was presented and discussed at the meeting of the Inter-Agency Group on Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) on 8 December 2012.
4. Second, a very successful expert workshop on "Skills Indicators and Policies in Low Income Countries (LICs)" took place in Turin at the ILO International Training Centre on 6-8 March 2012. The workshop was organised by the OECD and the ILO in collaboration with the World Bank and with the financial support and active participation of the German Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development and the Korean Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade. Both Ministries organised a couple of joint sessions to highlight the work they have been doing on promoting the development of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in partner countries.
5. The workshop had several objectives:
  - Give experts from LICs and other countries the opportunity to comment and provide feedback on the revised draft interim report on skills indicators. In particular, these experts were asked to comment on the usefulness and relevance of the conceptual framework that is proposed and the initial list of indicators that have been developed, taking into account their own national circumstances
  - Provide an opportunity for knowledge sharing about building appropriate systems of indicators for guiding skill development policies, including South-South dialogue on sharing good practice in this area and “cutting-edge” knowledge on the use of different types of survey instruments (adult skills surveys, labour force surveys, school-to-work surveys, health surveys, etc.) to collect information on skills for employment.
  - Identify priorities in LICs for capacity building to both collect information on skills and use this information in the formulation of policies for skill development.
  - Provide an opportunity to share the German and Korean experience of promoting skills development policies and measures in the area of TVET in partner countries.
6. The successful outcomes of the workshop included:
  - A good participation by key stakeholders. The workshop brought together representatives from both Ministries of Education and Labour as well as the national statistical offices in each of the pilot countries involved in Action 2 (Bangladesh, Benin, Malawi; and one representative from the pre-pilot country of Haiti) as well as from Russia, Kyrgyzstan and

Tajikistan, which had been invited by the European Training Foundation (ETF). There were also representatives from the German Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, the Korean Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade, the *Mexican Consejo Nacional de Normalización y certificación de competencias laborales*, CONOCER, as well as experts from the European Training Fund, ILO, OECD, UNESCO, UNCTAD, WHO and the World Bank.

- Confirmation and validation by the LICs, as well as the other countries present in the workshop, of the usefulness and relevance of the conceptual framework in the report and the proposed list of indicators, with only some minor amendments put forward. The countries present at the workshop welcomed the report and considered that it would serve as a useful benchmark for the further development of their own systems of skills indicators for guiding policy.
  - The workshop also provided a good opportunity to deepen the collaboration with WHO to develop indicators of health outcomes that could be linked to skills development based on household health surveys.
  - The participants considered the sessions on information sharing about the development of surveys to collect relevant data (including various types of household and enterprise surveys) as very useful.
  - Key priorities in capacity building and the main challenges involved were clearly identified by each of the countries participating in the workshop.
  - The workshop provided an excellent and well-received opportunity for countries to gain a useful insight into concrete examples of the types of initiatives that the German and Korean authorities have been involved in with partner countries to support and promote the development of TVET and improve its linkages to employability and productivity.
7. Overall, the workshop confirmed that the IOs' report on skills indicators will serve as a useful guiding role for LICs and other countries in improving their own statistics on skills for employment according to a common and comparable template. Indeed, a number of countries indicated that as a result of the workshop they intended to include questions in their forthcoming labour force surveys to collect the information required to produce the proposed indicators. The report should also serve as a useful federating device and common template for the collection of data on skills by all of key IOs involved in this area.
  8. Finally, the workshop also provided a good opportunity to hold discussions with the UNCTAD representative about how to increase the coordination and links between the work on the HRD pillar and the work on the Private Investment and Job Creation (PIJC) pillar. Agreement was reached on a number of steps to strengthen cooperation between these pillars, including:
    - Identifying the common challenges both pillars face with respect to data availability.
    - Strengthening collaboration on Bangladesh which is a common pilot country for both pillars, particularly with respect to outcome indicators related to employment and productivity.
  9. The next steps in the implementation of action 1 include:
    - The interim report on skills indicators will be finalised by the end of this year, including: the outcomes of the discussions at the workshop; a summary of the key capacity-building priorities that were identified by each of the pilot countries; guidelines on key skill-related questions to include in household and employer surveys; and a stock-take of the data availability for each of the proposed indicators.

- As part of Action 2 under the HRD pillar, countries will be encouraged and provided with some technical support to take concrete steps towards improving the definition, collection and use of indicators on skills supply, demand and mismatch, along the lines of the conceptual framework, within their national action plans on skills for employment.
- A final report with the full database will be prepared for end 2014.

## Action 2 Enhance National Skills Strategies on Skills for Employment

11. On 3 February, the ILO received written formal agreement from the Ministry of Education of Bangladesh to join the set of pilot countries under the G20 HRD pillar, together with Benin and Malawi. Work continues in Haiti to coordinate efforts by the principal international organizations working on skills and employment and to include government representatives in knowledge-sharing events given the interest expressed in becoming the fourth pilot country.
12. Since the beginning of the year, inter-ministerial workshops in Cotonou (April 2012) and Dhaka (March 2012) established the foundation for Action Plans through which the IOs and other agencies could coordinate support for implementing national strategies on skills for employment. This followed the example set in the first workshop in Lilongwe (October 2011).
13. The three national workshops used similar templates in preparing draft Action Plans. Each one began with ministry officials articulating national objectives and policies on education and training for employment, productivity and development. The workshop participants mapped existing support from IOs and bilateral agencies against these priorities – identifying gaps and areas of potential overlap and reviewed the existing institutional mechanisms for inter-ministerial and inter-agency coordination. The draft Action Plans have been set out in matrix format listing 5-7 objectives with their relationship to national priorities and a set of deliverables for each that identify national responsibility and IO support with specific time lines. Where funding is not yet available the deliverable is listed as tentative.
14. **Bangladesh.** On 24-25 March, the ADB, ILO and World Bank co-organized a series of workshops with the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Labour to define a coordinated Programme of Support through which the IOs can help operationalize the National Action Plan for the Implementation of the National Skills Development Policy (NSDP). The NSDP was formally adopted in January.
15. The Government's TVET Reform project, funded by the European Commission with technical support by the ILO, has been instrumental in developing the NSDP, which is to be implemented through the National Skills Development Council (NSDC). The ADB and the World Bank are providing substantial support to the Ministry of Education and the NSDC over the next few years, raising the opportunity for substantial gains from improved coordination among the three projects. The ADB and the Government will commence design of a major skills development project in 2012 which will provide support to the implementation of the NSDP.
16. The NSDC is crafting an Action Plan for the implementation of the national skills development policy to set out responsibilities for all relevant agencies and stakeholders, including time-bound targets and performance measures over a 5-year period. Based on the discussions with representatives of industries, employers' and workers' associations, NGOs, training institutions, government ministries and international and bilateral agencies (including from Canada, Germany, and the UK), the G20 pilot country Programme of Support is likely to specify actions that will support that Action Plan by: strengthening inter-project coordination; improving inter-ministerial coordination under the NSDC; building capacity to collect better information on skills indicators through labour market information systems; and facilitating participation by

Bangladesh decision-makers and stakeholders in knowledge sharing events organized under the G20 HRD pillar.

17. Means of supporting priority objectives within the NSDP are also expected to be agreed, for example, to strengthen Industrial Skill Council, to connect NGOs' job training in the informal economy to the national skills development system, or to incorporate training needs and provision in strategies for sustainable development. Further work is also expected on linking training provider networks with industry development plans to better focus skills formation towards supporting the realization of national development plans. Coordination opportunities seem particularly acute in several technical areas where all the projects are active, such as competency standards, teacher training, gender equity in TVET, data collection and management information systems; and training quality assurance. Additional coordination in data collection is being discussed, as noted above, on employment and productivity outcomes of private investment and job creation.
18. The draft Programme of Support for 2012-13 will be refined and finalised through consultation among the three technical cooperation projects with the NSDC over the next few months. The revised ADB's Skills Development Project and its follow-on stage, the World Bank's Skills Training Enhancement Program, and the expected continuation of the ILO's TVET Reform project including the Skills to Work Transition Survey in 2013, will be the means of delivering this coordinated support.
19. **Benin.** The Ministry of Labour convened the "Planning Workshop for the National Action Plan on Skills Development for Employment" on 4 April in Cotonou with the Ministry of Employment and the Ministry of Secondary Education. Some seventy representatives of the ministries, the social partners, the ILO, UNESCO, the UN and bilateral agencies participated in the workshop. The outcome of their discussion is a set of priorities and means of achieving them for the 2012-13 national action plan under the G20 pilot country initiative
20. The keystone objectives of the action plan are first, to improve inter-ministerial coordination of TVET projects and programmes, and second, to contribute to the Poverty Reduction Strategy that has been defined by the Government. The G20 Training Strategy and the TVET Sector Review undertaken jointly by UNESCO and the ILO (May 2011) and the recommendations of the stakeholder workshop last July provided the analytical underpinnings for a national Action Plan to improve TVET delivery, accessibility and impact.
21. The workshop participants agreed with the draft action plan that had been prepared by an inter-ministerial committee with support from the ILO. The plan contains five objectives that encompass some 22 action points, each with an identified lead agent, partners among other government agencies, social partners, and IOs, and a time table. The key objectives and their action points are designed to improve: inter-agency coordination in the area of skills for employment, information on demand for skills, quality and relevance of skills development by both public and private providers, job growth in higher-skill occupations, and greater knowledge sharing within the Region and more widely through the G20 HRD pillar.
22. The next steps include: establishing an inter-agency coordination mechanism as the cornerstone of the national Action Plan (Government by 1 July), production of a mapping of development partners' work on skills development as a starting point for coordination (ILO by end June), and formal endorsement of the Action Plan by the three ministries. Ongoing capacity-building projects implemented by UNESCO and the ILO will provide some support for the Action Plan. The Action Plan will be used to define a new UNESCO intervention in the field of TVET in the framework of UNESCO multi-donor programme Capacity Building for Education for All (Cap-EFA). UNESCO intervention is planned to start June 2012. The World Bank is trying to re-assign funds from their Multi-Donor Trust Fund to Benin for the skills surveys.

23. The development of the Action Plan anticipates the possibility that Government representatives might have the opportunity of reporting on this process and of their expectations for eventual results at the Mexico Summit. Coordinating between the Government organizers of the workshop with their representatives to the Summit will be a priority should this opportunity materialise.
24. **Malawi.** The planning workshop for the Pilot Country Action Plan took place in Lilongwe in October 2011, as reported previously. The IOs have taken the following steps in support of the Action Plan drafted during that inter-ministerial technical workshop: UNESCO has mobilised external resources, including from the Korean government and the multi-donor programme Capacity Building for Education for All (Cap-EFA) which will include coordination support for the implementation of the Action Plan. The ILO has designated some internal resources for technical support to the Action Plan to expand the mapping of agency support and to conduct a participatory review of existing inter-ministerial coordination mechanisms. It has raised external resources to work with the National Statistics Office to undertake a School to Work Transition Survey aimed at identifying skill needs of potential employers and the education and training needs and employment aspirations of young people. The AfDB has continued capacity-building work with the aim of providing financial support to undertake the first national Labour Force Survey. There are ongoing opportunities to incorporate testing of the skills for employment indicators in these surveys.
25. The finalisation of the Action Plan and agreement on a new implementation schedule will proceed as appropriate following the current transition of Government.
26. **Haiti.** In a letter to the ILO Director-General dated 18 April, the Secretary of State for Skills Development conveyed the Government's decision to join the set of pilot countries under the G20 HRD pillar. This decision reflects the Government's commitment towards skills development for "strong, sustainable and balanced growth" as part of its broad strategy for Education, Employment, Environment, and the Rule of Law. A Presidential Commission for Skills Development has been established to define policies for this sector, comprising the relevant ministries and training institutions as well as representatives of employers' and workers' organizations. The Plan of Action for the G20 initiative on HRD will define a set of priorities through which the International Organizations can coordinate their support to this new strategy and its implementation
27. Based on preliminary consultations with officials in the education and the labour ministries, including during the Turin workshop on skills indicators, efforts had already begun to coordinate new project proposals with support already underway (UNESCO, IADB, ILO) in order to look for synergies and develop coordination mechanisms as in the other pilot countries, as well as to explore resource mobilisation with interested donor agencies. Priority is being placed now on moving from crisis response to institutional development and to link job training to emerging efforts to attract investment and leverage job creation.

#### **Cross-cutting deliverables**

28. Additional deliverables under the HRD Pillar have been agreed through the decisions of the DWG in the cross-cutting priority areas of knowledge sharing and green growth.
29. **Knowledge-sharing platform.** The development of a "global public-private knowledge sharing platform on skills for employment" (Global KSP) was included in the road map submitted by the four international organizations and accepted by the DWG at its March 2011 meeting in Paris. Options for the Global KSP were initially discussed by the DWG at its meeting in Cape Town in July and next steps in its development were agreed at its 31 January meeting in Mexico City. These steps included how the KSP would contribute to the DWG's knowledge sharing pillar and meet the expectation expressed by the G20 labour and employment ministers at their meeting in

Paris on 26-27 September 2011 for the ILO as well as the OECD, as appropriate (...) “*to establish a knowledge-sharing platform to promote skills development in line with the G20 Training Strategy*”.

30. As stated previously, the objective of the KSP is to collect case studies, research findings, strategy papers from policymakers, vocational education and training (TVET) institutions, the private sector, academic institutions, bilateral agencies, as well as IOs, that have experience using skills development to improve employability, productivity, and social development and who are interested in learning from others’ experience. This website is expected to share the answers that governments, employers, workers and international organizations are finding to the question of what works to bridge the world of education and training to decent and productive work. The G20 Training Strategy is the guiding framework for organizing the content.
31. The initial prototype, developed in November 2011, served as a first step towards visualizing what the future website could look like. This prototype has been tested and improved based on inputs received from stakeholders (G20 DWG discussion on 31 January, ILO staff, an initial focus group of employers, and discussions with IO partners in December 2011) and based on general usability design principles, including long-term maintenance requirements and costs and incorporating good practice on accessibility for persons with disabilities.
32. In March and April, the ILO launched initial Focus Group Testing and designed an E-Survey to obtain feedback on the KSP prototype from potential users and website experts. Based on a small sample of results, a second design iteration of the website is being produced, which will be subjected to broader testing. The findings from testing this revised prototype will be incorporated into the KSP pilot stage, beginning in June with content in three selected issues of the G20 Training Strategy (skills for youth employment, skills anticipation focusing on green jobs, and training accessibility focusing on disability inclusion).
33. An Advisory Group is being formed with representatives from partner IOs, the International Organization of Employers, the International Trade Union Confederation, and the coordinators for the G20 HRD pillar, and the Technical Working Group. The role of the Advisory Group is to test the prototype and provide strategic advice on subsequent ‘scaling up’ efforts. A Technical Working Group for the platform has also been organized, comprising IT and web development specialists from the ILO. The main purpose of this group is to provide technical inputs and advice on the re-design of the prototype, its proposed navigation and search functions.
34. Upon the conclusion of the testing phase, the ILO will invite its social partners, international organizations and institutions involved in preparing the G20 Training Strategy to contribute content while at the same time undertake the necessary steps towards developing the actual website, aiming at an expected launch date of December 2012.
35. The Global KSP will broaden the range of knowledge and experience made readily available to users through cooperation among the IO to provide a “one-stop” website which pools the relevant knowledge products on skills for employment of each organization. The KSP is being organized to enable users with different degrees of interest (e.g. policy advisors, employers, training institutions, academics) to find what they need – what they could put to use. Organizing content by the themes of the G20 Training Strategy and its building blocks corresponds to actual policy dilemmas, which will be searchable by region, country, economic sector, and source. The KSP will provide direct access to the broader internet-based knowledge sharing resource for the G20 more broadly and that are maintained by the individual IOs.
36. As originally conceived, the internet knowledge-sharing platform will be supplemented by workshops, communities of practice, and other more face-to-face learning opportunities. The next knowledge-sharing workshop being proposed in line with the G20 Training Strategy is

expected to be on financing training, tentatively scheduled for December 2012 at the ILO's International Training Centre (Turin, Italy).

37. **Skills for green growth.** At the 19-20 March meeting of the G20 DWG (Seoul, Korea), the discussion on green growth included the question of how national skills development systems can contribute to sustainable development strategies, in terms of unlocking employment potential and in terms of avoiding skill shortages and bottlenecks in the transitions to lower carbon economies.
38. This concern has led the Inter-Agency Group on TVET to establish a technical *Working Group on Greening TVET and Skills Development*. Their first meeting was held in Bonn, Germany on 10-11 April. Eight international and European agencies have already joined this working group, including the ADB, European Training Foundation, ILO, OECD and UNESCO. The objectives of the Working Group include awareness raising, knowledge sharing, joint research to generate new knowledge, and capacity and resource development.
39. An immediate output of the Working Group will be a joint leaflet articulating a concise message on including education and training in sustainable development strategies and summarizing empirical findings on countries' efforts and their impact based on the work of each agency. The research findings and policy recommendations on skills for green jobs have been reflected in the "Non-Prescriptive Toolkit on Inclusive Green Growth," prepared by the UN partners for the G20 DWG and will be promoted in the UNESCO Third International Congress on TVET hosted by China (Shanghai, 14-16 May) and in the UN Rio +20 Conference on Sustainable Development

#### **Final remarks**

40. The actions are being implemented in accordance with the timeframe foreseen in the Seoul Multiyear Action Plan and respecting its core principles. Both actions deliver concrete outcomes directly benefitting LICs in their efforts to enhance inclusive and sustainable growth. Their ownership and partnership are at the core of the implementations of the actions. LICs' experts have validated the indicators on skills on employment. LICs' high level authorities from ministers of education and labour defined the priorities of the action plans and are committed to their implementation. International organizations and bilateral G20 agencies are pooling together resources and expertise on a complementary basis focussing on the areas in which each has a comparative advantage in supporting LICs. The participation of the private sector has been encouraged in the identification and the implementation of the actions plans as well as in the knowledge sharing process. Linkages have been promoted with other pillars such as knowledge sharing and private investment and job creation. Cross-cutting issues related to the transition to a greener economy are being integrated in the actions and have become a new focus of inter-agency collaboration. Synergies with other G20 streams such as the Employment and Labour Ministers are being promoted.