

**FEDERAL STATE BUDGETARY EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION
OF HIGHER EDUCATION
RUSSIAN PRESIDENTIAL ACADEMY OF NATIONAL ECONOMY
AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

Manuscript



Datukishvili Ekaterina Zurabovna

**POLITICAL TECHNOLOGIES FOR THE FORMATION OF THE
STATE-CIVIL IDENTITY IN THE POST-SOVIET SPACE
(IN THE CONTEXT OF RUSSIA, AZERBAIJAN AND GEORGIA)**

Summary of a candidate of political sciences thesis in
23.00.02 – Political Institutions, Processes and Technologies.

Research Advisor:
Doctor of Political Sciences, Professor
Timofeeva Lidiya Nikolaevna

Moscow

2021

The relevance of the research topic is caused by the need of formation a state-civil identity in the republics of the former USSR that gained independence and refused, in this regard, the concept of state-civil identity, named "Soviet man", formed over the years.

The building of such an identity in freshly-formed states with a multi-ethnic and multi-confessional population is necessary. It helps to solve internal social and economic problems, regulate ethno-political conflicts in order to gain a political stability, as well as preserve good-neighborly relations with other countries. This process takes place in the context of multidirectional trends in the development of modern international relations, taking into account the historical and cultural traditions of these entities, the experience of existence as part of the largest in the territory multinational state, which stood at the head of the world socialist system.

It has been observed that there are two trends in the world: centripetal and centrifugal. Empires break up into sovereign states. Then sovereign states are united in new unions. On the one hand, there is a regional integration, diffusion and, in the final count, an assimilation of individual societies, which allows us to state the gradual formation of a single social-political structure, in which the socio-cultural differences of individual societies are gradually neutralized. The example for this can be the Euro integration, the formation of the European Union and its focus on the formation of the inter-identity in contrast to multiculturalism. However, it hasn't been without losses – an example of the UK's exit from the EU. On the other hand, the aspiration of the actors of political processes in the different regions of the world has been observed. This gives an opportunity to isolate, strengthen and develop the sovereignty through the formation of the state-civil identity among the population, to a different extent, taking into account the socio-cultural, historical, geographical and other characteristic of these newly-formed states. An example of such state entities are the countries of the former Soviet

Union, united during its existence by a single ideological and international principle.

The leadership of most of the former Soviet republics considers the formation of a strong state-civil identity as a key political task and at the same time as the main strategic priority of maintaining the state security. In this case the process of integration into global political space considered by the elite of these states as a second derivate task, that does not prevent them from uniting into such regional entities as the Eurasian Economic Union, the Collective Security Treaty Organization, etc.

At this moment, the growing importance of the Russian Federation (to a greater extent) and other post-Soviet states in the modern geopolitical process is obvious for everybody. As was truly noted by the President of Russia Vladimir Putin, in one of his program articles, the unique geographical location of the countries of the former USSR determines their main role in creating and providing a system of global collective security. In that vein, it's obvious, that world has to be interested in a stable projected development of the sovereign states-subjects of the former USSR.

A comprehensive study of the process of formation of the state-civil identity among the population of these states at the national and supranational levels (within the frames of various integration associations – the CIS, the EEC) is getting a practical importance in the context of forecasting the directions of further development of the foreign policy process, both at the global and regional levels. The consideration of the above-mentioned process gives an opportunity to determine both the parameters of the foreign policy potential of these actors of international politics, and the real possibilities of their integration into the global political structure.

Nowadays, it's obvious, that in the conditions of dynamically changing and constantly becoming more complex social relations, as well as the transformation of the model of legal democratic statehood into a civilizational standard of political development, the problem of finding new grounds for the

legitimacy of the state and the power of the ruling elites, is being actualized. Politicians of the leading states of the world perceive the state-civil identity as the most promising basis for providing the legitimacy and stability of the state power and the political system in the whole, and therefore they are actively trying to form it with a purpose.

In that vein, the important task for the modern study is an identification and implementation of practical opportunities, in which the state-civil identity obtains the character of an effective mechanism, which provides the legitimacy of state power and the stability of socio-political development.

The choice of Russia, Azerbaijan, Georgia as a subject of the research of this work is dictated by the following obstacles.

First of all, the mutual geopolitical and geographical conditionality of their neighborhood with Russia within the frames of the Caucasus region and the need for mutual consideration of their foreign policy orientations in the process of implementing the international policy of each of the states.

Secondly, Russia, Georgia and Azerbaijan are multi-ethnic societies and, a state-civil identity, as a rule, is formed in them according to similar scenarios. So, the centrifugal tendencies present in them (the Chechen Republic in Russia, Abkhazia and South Ossetia in Georgia, Nagorno-Karabakh in Azerbaijan) become a kind of an indicator of the problematic sphere of the process of constructing the identity in its civil-state field, revealing to us the hidden difficulties of a single-order nature. It has to be noted, that nowadays the last of mentioned aspects is hugely actualized, because the permanent conflict in the Nagorno-Karabakh, which was recently turned into the stage of another fierce military battle. But thanks to the Russian peacekeeping mission was immediately stopped. It seems that these events, along with the undeniable tragic consequences, form specific conditions for the development of the state and civil identity in Azerbaijan. Also very significant is the multi-confessional factor, which unites the selected countries for analysis - Christian-Islamic and Islamic-Christian.

Thirdly, within the frames of the post-Soviet states self-determination, it is interesting to deduce the various numbers of the typology of the development of a new state-civil identity, that replaced the unified "Soviet" one.

The degree of scientific development of the research topic. Various aspects of our research subject have received uneven coverage in the scientific literature.

Traditionally, huge attention is paid to the problems of essence, formation and developing of different types of the identity. Thereupon, it has to be noted, that domestic political science is in the global trend of research in this direction, which has been developing since the second half of the XX century.

Also, it has to be marked, that the traditions of the concepts of "identity" were formed in the Western social sciences under the influence of the philosophical tradition, the formation of which took place in the antique era. In this regard, it has to be stated, that various aspects of social identification were always in the focus of attention of Western philosophers during the period of the development of German classical philosophy (for example, in the works of G. V. F. Hegel, I. Kant, F. V. J. Schelling, etc.), non-classical philosophy (the works of E. Husserl, M. Heidegger, K. Jaspers), post-non-classical philosophy (the works of J. Deleuze, J. Derrida, O. Comte, G. Spencer, M. Foucault, etc.). Within the frames of modern Western philosophy, various aspects of identity find their meaning in the works of J. Baudrillard, P. Riker, E. Toffler, F. Fukuyama, Y. Habermas, etc.

Foreign sociological studies, which develop the problems of personal identity in the context of various aspects of social interaction within social communities, have gained the special importance as a basic structure for the study of political identity. In this regard, it is necessary to mark the works of J. Mead, R. Brubaker and F. Cooper.

A special contribution to the scientific development of the problems of identity was made by E. Erickson, who not only introduced the concept of "identity" into scientific circulation, but also justified an interdisciplinary approach to the study of this phenomenon, based on the use of the methodology of all social

sciences. Western political science begins to develop the concept of "political identity", starting from the second half of the XX century, on the basis of interdisciplinary research within the frames of its methodological approach. The political context of identity analysis begins to express itself in the consideration of the problems of political mentality, political culture, the dynamics and transformation of political consciousness, the formation of political images during the process of political socialization. In this regard, the works of B. Andersen, P. Berger and T. Lukman, E. Giddens, L. Greenfield, E. Hoffman, M. Castels, Y. Plasserault, C. Cooley, J. Stephenson, A. Touren, C. Taylor, S. Huntington, etc. , attract attention.

Turning to the state of the "identity" concept study within the framework of domestic political science, first of all, it is necessary to note the significant contribution of V.A. Tishkov, L. M. Drobizheva, V.Y. Zorin, M.A. O.Y. Malinova, M.A. Astvatsaturova, E.A. Pain and others.

It is also worth highlighting the studies of I. S. Semenenko devoted to the problems of conceptualization of identity as a resource of social development.

Moreover, among the domestic studies devoted to the consideration of the essence of identity in the political context, it has to be noted the works of G. A. Ayvazyan, T. G. Asimov, T. V. Bugaychuk, D. G. Kogatko, V. S. Komarovsky, S. V. Kortunov, O. A. Koryakovtsev, K. V. Malov, Yu. V. Mukhlynkina, D. I. Saetgaraev, V. V. Titov, G. A. Filatov, E. V. Morozova, O. V. Popova, etc.

Series of study are devoted to the analysis of the political identity in the frames of the various integration associations. Thus, the identity of the European Union is successfully studied by G. C. Klimova, in the former USSR-P. C. Ivanov, Y. C. Irkhin, O. A. Nesterchuk, A. A. Starostin, I. N. Timofeev, L. N. Timofeeva, L. C. Tomaichuk, etc.

The works devoted to the characteristics of various political technologies and their various target applications have the great importance for the analysis of problematic real-world studies. In this regard, we should mark the studies of M. G.

Anokhin, O. E. Grishin, T. E. Grinberg, A. A. Ivantsov, V. S. Komarovsky, Yu. I. Matveenko, I. A. Savchenko, V. B. Stroganov, O. F. Shabrov, etc.

Among the Georgian and Azerbaijani political scientists, who are developing the problems of this researches' subject, it is necessary to point out the works of D. Aprasidze, Sh. Apkhaidze, G. Zedania, G. Nodia, S. R. Mammadov, M. Khartishvili, Sh. N. Yagizarov.

At the same time, there is an obvious lack of special political science works in modern science, the subject of which is the examination of technologies for the formation of state-civil identity in a comparative context. Moreover, the concept of "state-civil identity" does not have a unified definition in scientific thought even to the present time, which is why there are no clear criteria for its identification. In this regard, in existing works, the state-civil identity is often identified with the national one.

The purpose of the study is to determine the features of key technologies used in Russia, Azerbaijan and Georgia for the formation of the state-civil identity of the population based on the analysis of modern political practice.

For the achievement of this goal, it is necessary to solve the following **research tasks**:

- To analyze the essence of the concepts «identity» and «state-civil identity»;
- find out the conceptual ways to the research of leading political technologies, as to a tool of formation of the state-civil identity;
- To determine the content of the concept of the official political discourse of the elite and its specificity as a political technology in the process of development the state-civil identity in the examined states;
- To mark the features of media discourse technology in the formation of the state-civil identity in Russia, Georgia and Azerbaijan.

The object of the study is the process of formation of the state-civil identity in Russia, Azerbaijan and Georgia.

The subject of the research is the political technologies of formation and development of the state-civil identity in Russia, Georgia and Azerbaijan, implemented at the present stage.

The theoretical and methodological basis of the dissertation research consists of systemic, structural-functional, discursive, conflictological and communicative approaches.

The author also comes from the priority of applying the methodology of the constructive approach to the study of the phenomenon of the state-civil identity. In this regard, in order to achieve the goal and solve the problems of this study, we used the theoretical conclusions of the classics of constructivism – Y. Anderson, P. Berger, E. Gellner, T. Lukman, Zh. Piaget etc. Accordingly to them, the state-civil identity is considered as a social construct formed through purposeful reflexive intersubjective socio-political practice. The leading participant of which is the state, which, through the implementation of its functions, creates concepts and images, significant for the formation of constructs of "conformity". The fundamental basis of this process is the value structure, which forms the space of political culture. In addition, the methods and research principles of political conflictology and comparative political science were significant during the preparation of this study.

The solution of the main tasks, which were set in the dissertation research, is achieved by using a range of different methods characteristic of political science.

In particular, dialectical, comparative, functional, system-structural and synergetic methods were used to implement a comprehensive characterization of state-civil identity as a political phenomenon.

The methods of discourse analysis and concept analysis were used to analyze political technologies implemented within the framework of the official discourses of the countries under consideration, as well as the media for the state-civil identity formation.

The estimation of the influence of political ideologies on the process of formation of the state and the civil identity was carried out on the basis of the comparative historical method.

The empirical basis of the study was a set of analytical components of normative and official documents, the results of sociological research and content analysis of the media of the three states, as well as the included observation of the author:

- official documents and normative legal acts issued by the highest state authorities of Russia, Azerbaijan and Georgia;

- materials of the Internet sites of the highest state authorities of the examined countries. First of all, the official websites of the Presidents;

- materials of the Internet media of the examined countries ("Vzglyad", "RIA Novosti", "Lenta.ru", "Georgia Online", "Sputnik Georgia", "Vesti AZ", "Media AZ", etc.);

- materials of sociological researchers, which were held in Russia, Azerbaijan and Georgia, illustrating the state of public opinion ("Levada Center", "National Democratic Institute "(Georgia)", "Center for Social Research" (Azerbaijan);

- materials of the author's Internet questionnaire on the problems of the formation of state-civil identity (an Internet questionnaire was conducted among 300 students of higher educational institutions of Moscow who have Russian, Azerbaijani and Georgian citizenship).

Results of the research:

The conducted research allows us to confirm the correctness of its main hypothesis, which is reflected in the following main conclusions:

1. The concept of the "state-civil identity" is a difficult ideological construct, which was created under the influence of the target influence of the political elite and the mass media, depending on the historically formed cultural codes of society. This is a dual phenomenon, that combines, firstly, the conscious self-identification of citizens with a social community, forming the "image of we

are the people", and, secondly, their political ideas, that is, complexes of concepts, statements, explanations and value orientations, associated with the institution of the state, its political structure, the language of national communication, the "image of the future".

The "sense of the state" is formed through the educational and ideological activities of key actors – the ruling political elite and the mass media.

The state-civil identity is the most important component of the integral characteristics of the individual, as well as the key basis for ensuring the legitimacy of the government. In that vein, the formation of this type of identity should be considered as one of the most important directions of the internal policy of the state, which is necessary to mark as an identity policy. At the same time, the ratio of the two components within the frames of state-civil identity has to be considered in a hierarchical context – the prerequisite for the formation of civil identity is the existence of a stable state identity, and social, including a pronounced ethno-political component.

2. The instrument for forming the policy of the state-civil identity is a set of political technologies acts. The essence of political technologies is always determined by their intended target, associated with a purposeful influence on the community to motivate them to perform the necessary actions in order to achieve the set goals. As a result of the analysis, we have identified two leading technologies, involved in the formation of the state-civil identity of the three states – the official discourse of political elites and the media discourse. Both discourses are processes that have their own technologies of implementation.

The official political discourse of the elite is of key importance in the formation of state-civil identity, which is a complex process that includes various unequal components. The main of them are the linguistic components themselves, such as text and speech, which constitute the "core of the external expression" of the discourse and also the characteristics of a specific socio-cultural situation, that form semantic projections in the consciousness of the subject of the discourse, which determine the "objective determination" of its content. The functional

purpose of the official discourse is to exert a manipulative and regulatory influence on public consciousness, which is enhanced by its "ideological bias", which increases the "evidentiary ability" of the correctness of political measures implemented by the power elite.

The formation of the state-civil identity within the frames of the fulfilment of identity policy involves two successive stages that ensure the political socialization of the individual. At the first stage, the power elite should construct ideological concepts within the frames of the official political discourse and the media discourse, which has an auxiliary meaning in relation to it, currently acquiring the status of an independent power subject. At the second stage, these concepts are integrated into the public consciousness through task-oriented use of political technologies, the main of which is the "modeling of history" and the creation of mechanisms for interaction between civil society actors and government structures.

3. By the target and functional orientation the political technologies of elite and media can be divided into three main groups: technologies aimed to establish or change the order of communication of participants in the political process, criteria and the nature of its interaction; technologies, which show the new ideas, values and goals to the masses, for their favorable perception and assimilation, on the purpose of subsequent manipulation of public consciousness, behavior and actions as a whole, and its individual groups, different in many indicators (qualitative composition, number, etc.). In this case, the author considers the stable construction of political and ethnic images by the power elite and the leading media, which have a stable historical determination, as well as politically significant symbols in the structure of political culture.

4. In the examined countries three main types of media discourse technologies are mainly used:

- Technologies, that provide the formation of new ideas, norms, values and categories in the structure of mass consciousness which reflect the criteria of a promising state-civil identity;

- technologies, that provides the achievement of a directed change in the content and rules of interaction between the leading actors of the internal political process;
- Technologies, which allow to manipulate the behavior of the public masses.

Within the frames of the modern media discourse, the media are rightly considered as the most important actor of the political process, as the "fourth power" in the system of separation of powers, by their status and significance, in fact, similar to state and municipal authorities. In the context of the realization of these functions the modern mass media make the hidden control of people's political consciousness and behavior, ensure the perception and assimilation by citizens of the required political and social rules, norms, patterns of political and social behavior, while simultaneously controlling the authorities by independent journalistic activities.

This set of tools makes it possible for the media discourse to significantly influence the process of forming the state-civil identity. The special aspects of such influence are determined by the characteristics of the media-political model of interaction between the media and the powerful political elite. From our point of view, the effective influence of the media on the process of forming the state-civil identity expects the implementation from the ruling elite of a constructive combination of individual media-political systems – libertarian, socio-libertarian and authoritarian, the purpose of which is to provide opportunities for the indirect implementation through the media of the key principles of identity policy in terms of ensuring the independence of the media, which is a determining factor in preventing the emergence of confrontational relations with them - libertarian, socio-libertarian and authoritarian, the purpose of which is to provide opportunities for the indirect implementation through the media of the key principles of identity policy in terms of ensuring the independence of the media, which is a determining factor in preventing the emergence of confrontational relations with them.

It has to be noted, that within the frames of the information content of the media, there is actually no alternative discourse, which has a significant impact on the formation of the state-civil identity. This circumstance eliminates the discourse of

coordination in the activities of the media, which seems to be due to the number of factors, the main of which are:

- aggregation of the ruling political elite and the media on the basis of ideas about significant events in the domestic political process, idealization of images of the historical development of national statehood, or the image of the enemy. This circumstance virtually excludes the presence of influential opposition media. This situation is typical for Georgia and Azerbaijan;
- features of the state policy in the sphere of media, within the frames of which the activities of opposition media can be recognized as illegal on various grounds (for example, in the case of funding from abroad);
- an expressed disinterest or inability of the opposition media to offer an alternative concept of state-civil identity to the official ideological concept.

5. The formation of state-civil identity is a key task of the post-Soviet states, the solution of which is the main background for preserving and strengthening their sovereignty. In that vein, the process of formation the state-civil identity as a separate direction of state policy, in the frames of which a unidirectional impact on the public consciousness of the meaningful concepts of the official discourse of the elites and media discourse should be ensured. At the same time, the introduction of positive ideological and political constructs into the public consciousness based on the selective use of historical facts that consolidate the civil community and form bilateral relations of states on the principles of mutual respect and peaceful coexistence should be considered as the main political technology for the formation of state-civil identity. The features of the impact of the official political discourse of the elite in the three states on the process of forming state-civil identity are determined. The official political discourse of the elites of Russia, Azerbaijan and Georgia is contradictory and contains both positive and negative characteristics due to their "genetic dependence" on the discourse of the Soviet state. This circumstance, as well as the lack of stable traditions of the existence of legal, democratic statehood and the development of the institution of civil society in the examined countries determine the simplicity and primitiveness of the content

of the concepts of the official discourses of the examined countries, their extreme dependence on the personal characteristics and ideological position of individual representatives of the ruling political elite, the ritual nature of political communication, outside influence on the content of discourses of various manipulators of public consciousness – image makers, political technologists, political consultants, who become virtually independent subjects (developers), thereby replacing the most important function of representatives of the powerful political elite.

The importance of the media discourse, both traditional and new – network media, in the process of forming state-civil identity, has been revealed. Also, the typical technologies of influence used by the media in the examined states of this process have been determined. The common and specific features of the process of formation of the state-civil identity in Russia, Azerbaijan and Georgia have been formed. It is established, that in the first two countries has been formed a hybrid model of this process, assuming the unconditional hegemony of the power elite in determining the media content, and in Georgia has been formed a competitive model as a result of conflicts between the government and the opposition, which prevents the development of a single ideological concept of the state-civil identity in conditions of a low level of political consciousness of the population.

The analysis of the content of the modern OPD of the examined states in the context of the influence on the process of formation of the state-civil identity allows us to conclude, that there is a similarity of political technologies, which are used to achieve this goal. The leading of them is "modeling of history" in the context of creating interdependent myths about a single national community, acting as a key criterion for the legitimation of the power of the political elite and the main subject of the political process, which delegates its powers to the power elite.

The theoretical significance of the work consists in the fulfilment of a comprehensive analysis of the methodology of the process of forming the state-civil identity in Russia, Azerbaijan and Georgia. In this context, conclusions have been made about the specifics of the use of political technologies in order to

increase its effectiveness. The main conclusions of the presented research can be used for further research of the influence of the activities of key actors of the internal political process on the political outlook of citizens of a particular state, as well as for studying the interconnections and correlation of state and civil identity as separate types of social identity of an individual.

The practical significance of the work is expressed in the possibility of using the main features and conclusions of the study in order to develop the concept of information policy, effective political management, which are necessary for the development of a stable state-civil identity, which acts as a key factor in ensuring internal political stability and social securing in Russia, Azerbaijan and Georgia. In addition, the materials of the presented research can be used in the educational process for the formation of general and special courses in political science.

Approbation of the research.

The main features and conclusions of the study are reflected in 10 publications of the author in Russian and English (including co-authorship), 7 of which were published in scientific journals, recommended by the Higher Attestation Commission under the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation:

1. Datukishvili E. Z. Technologies of participation of the Georgian and Azerbaijani diasporas in the political system of Russia // Ethno-socium and interethnic culture. - 2020. - № 2 (140). Pp. 94-103.

2. Datukishvili E. Z. Media activity on the formation of the state-civil identity in the post-Soviet space (on the example of Azerbaijan, Georgia and Russia) / / Ethno-socium and Interethnic Culture. - 2020. - № 6 (144). Pp. 59-67.

3. Datukishvili E. Z. The state-civil identity as a subject field of modern political science. // Questions of political science. -2020. Vol. 10. No. 9 (61). - pp. 2717-2723. DOI 10.35775/PSI.2020.61.9.008.

4. Datukishvili E. Z. The impact of migration flows on the identity of Russians //Questions of political science. -2019. Vol. 9. No. 11 (51). - pp. 2421-2430. DOI 10.35775/PSI.2019.51.11.012.

5. Datukishvili E. Z. National and civil identity in Russia: problems of compound //Issues of national and federal relations. -2019. Vol. 9. No. 10 (55). - pp. 1682-1690. DOI 10.35775/PSI.2019.55.10.013.

6. Datukishvili E. Z., Musina N. K., Prezharova V. G., Simonova S. V. Education: how does the state affect this fragile and plastic system //Questions of political science. -2018. Vol. 8. No. 11 (39). - pp. 959-972.

7. Datukishvili E.Z. The influence of migration flows to the identity of Russian people //Political Science Issues. -2019. T. 9. № 4 (34). -C. 385-393. DOI 10.35775/PSI.2020.34.4.004

Also 3 works were published in scientific journals indexed by the Russian Science Citation Index:

1. Datukishvili E. Z. Political technologies of formation of the state identity //In the book: Political Representation and Public Power: transformational challenges and prospects. Materials of the Annual All-Russian Scientific Conference with an international participation. Edited by O. V. Gaman-Golutvina, L. V. Smorgunov, L. N. Timofeeva. Moscow-2020. - p. 167.

2. Datukishvili E. Z. Political identity as a factor of Russia's development / / In the collection: Trajectories of Russia's Political development: institutions, projects, actors. Materials of the Annual All-Russian scientific conference of RAPN with an international participation. Moscow State Pedagogical University. // Moscow-2019. - pp. 126-127.

3. Datukishvili E. Z. National and civil identity in Russia: the problem of conjugation //In the book: Development Policy, the State and the World Order. Materials of the VIII Annual All-Russian Congress of Political

Scientists. Under the general editorship of O. V. Gaman-Golutvina, L. V. Smorgunov, L. N. Timofeeva. // Moscow-2018. - pp. 162-163.

The main points and conclusions have been tested in the following international scientific and practical conferences:

- The VIII Annual All-Russian Congress of Political Scientists of RAPN "Development Policy, the state and the world Order". Moscow, December 2018.
- International Scientific and Practical Conference "ASTANA - the City of Peace", Kazakhstan, Astana, June 2018.
- The annual All-Russian Scientific Conference of RAPN with an International participation "Trajectories of Russia's Political Development: Institutions, projects, actors". Moscow, December 2019.
- The Annual All-Russian Scientific Conference with an international participation RAPN ' 2020, Moscow.

The structure of the dissertation work consists of an introduction, three chapters, divided into six paragraphs a conclusion, a list of references and two appendices.

_____E.Z. Datukishvili