

**Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration
(RANEPA)**

Manuscript copyright



Francisco Javier Brambila Martínez

**A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE METHODS AND MECHANISMS
OF POLICY TRANSFER IN RUSSIA AND MEXICO BASED ON THE
FEATURES OF THEIR FEDERAL SYSTEMS**

Specialization (5.5.2): Political institutions, processes, technologies

Abstract

Candidate of Political Science dissertation

Dissertation advisor:

**Natalia V. Mikhailova, PhD
Associate professor, RANEPA**

Moscow 2024

Relevance of the research topic. Intense competition among contemporary nations is pushing states to seek effective tools to increase their capacity in all areas. Policy transfer has been a key source of novel methods of state administration in the past, however the practice has been marred by political interference that ultimately led to mixed results in the overall development of nations for the last decades.

Within the context of a multipolar world, surging regional powers offer insights to new policies as well as practices tailored to their competitive advantages in the absence of foreign intervention, however there is an absence of comparative studies as well as initiators and enablers of the practice beyond established stakeholders.

This research thereafter sets a framework for the unhindered exchange of ideas and practices among developing states to increase their growth as well as to increase their ability to respond to current challenges at a global scale.

The goal of this research is to identify ways to improve policy transfer practices in Russia and Mexico according to their needs in their current context.

Research objectives:

- 1) to study various approaches to policy transfer within the framework of development theories in Russia and Mexico;
- 2) to determine the features and effectiveness of policy transfer as a model of state development policy in Russia and Mexico;
- 3) to analyze the conceptual foundations of policy transfer at the current stage of development of Russia and Mexico;
- 4) to determine the tools and mechanisms of political and legal regulation of policy transfer, taking into account the peculiarities of the federal systems of Russia and Mexico;
- 5) to assess the plausibility of policy transfer in Russia and Mexico in the current context;
- 6) formulate new conceptual approaches to policy transfer based on the features of federal systems in the context of the international global power distribution struggle.

The object of research. The federal systems of Russia and Mexico in the context of their constitutional and political evolution according to various geopolitical challenges.

The subject of research. The various versions of the Russian and Mexican constitutions, the identification and analysis of power dynamics and groups in both countries, as well as the main features of their federal systems determined by their policy directions and budget-population ratios compared at an international level.

The hypothesis of the study. The features of federal systems determine the development of states for their direct impact on policies and laws and their evolution. Is thereafter suggested that whereas federal systems remain seemingly unchanged through time, they can reveal theoretical and methodological tools to assess effective methods of policy transfer, particularly on constitutional principles and budget allocation policies based on how their overall structure reacts to particular challenges.

Theoretical methodological foundations of the research. In order to identify and study the features of federated systems, an interdisciplinary approach is needed using several scientific concepts and methods, starting with induction, analysis, synthesis, comparison and analogy.

Within the framework of the system method, the features of federal systems are analyzed as a set of elements with special properties and functions that determine the potential of the state, its study and also the trends of its development. The methodology of structural functionalism considers the features of federal systems as key elements of the state, interrelated in their roles and functions in specific patterns and in accordance with the geostrategic goals of states or in their absence. According to postmodern methodology, the features of federal systems displace ideology in determining the development of the state and the means of increasing its potential.

This study analyzes the features of federal systems as key factors for a successful assessment of the state, its main elements, functions and needs. Based on this assessment, a comparative analysis can reveal a number of general patterns that

contribute to the revision and implementation of a promising political transfer in accordance with national interests and the context of the country.

Scientific novelty of the research:

1. This study examines the evolution of policy transfer in Russia and Mexico according to their legal framework, instruments and goals in the aftermath of the Cold War. A number of challenges and contradictory aspects of a political and legislative nature have been identified, for instance, how and to which degree policy transfer has led to the development of both nations under methods brokered by western institutions and nations.

2. Identical approaches to policy transfer, implemented simultaneously in Russia and Mexico during the last decade of the XX century were classified in based on their impact and further iterations accordingly.

3. The necessary mechanisms for the implementation of political transfer were identified in both countries and compared from which a comparative model was established according to various political, legislative and demographic indicators.

4. To determine the effectiveness of policy transfer, the evolution of both countries is studied. The prevalence of Russia's development in all sectors is noted despite both countries having similar economic and demographic indicators during the time of equal policy transfer and recommendations. This disparity is further explained by the different approaches regarding the implementation and modification of transferred policies. Thus, their success being determined by the ability of the state to adapt legislative instruments within the framework of a high concentration of powers in state institutions.

5. Taking into account the constant political and legal transformation of states, the evolution of both countries demonstrate that policy transfer can provide developing nations with roadmaps for initial growth if adapted accordingly. To that end, state institutions should be strengthened and isolated from ideological biases, so that new policies are formulated from various sources in accordance with the needs of society and the competitive advantages of the country.

Main provisions for the dissertation's defense:

1. In the context of modern states, policy transfer is the result of recommendations or "best practices" promoted by Governments and international organizations after the end of the Cold War. Their goal was to increase the potential of developing countries by mirroring the measures as well as the structures and functions of state institutions of global powers. However, policy transfer has been implemented in various countries around the world (including Russia and Mexico), without a significant acceleration in their development on the short term. As a result, policy recommendations have expanded to include deeper areas such as legal, budgetary, and ideological aspects, thus often undermining the sovereignty of states. Policy transfer today carries negative political connotations as well as lack a comprehensive methodology for their successful implementation and evaluation.

2. Transfer policy as a model of state development policy in Russia and Mexico is of great relevance as some of its elements and goals continue to be used today in the framework of legal and political processes, despite their various iterations over the last three decades. Furthermore, policy transfer can contribute to the development of a State if it is correctly selected based on its similarity to the country of origin and adapted to its needs and priorities. It is proposed that for an increased effectivity of transferred policies, their adaptation to national policies is necessary within the framework of high institutional power and balance, while in the absence of political biases. Furthermore, special attention should be paid to the implementation of policies at the regional level, as well as their degree of cooperation with the federal governments through the allocation of budgetary funds and distribution of constitutional powers.

3. The state development policy implemented within the framework of policy transfer in Russia and Mexico differs due to their different political contexts. On the one hand, Russia has embraced self-sufficiency and an active political role in the international arena, while on the other hand, Mexico lacks a constant, unified state policy amid various internal political forces in constant struggle for power. However, within the framework of a more equal distribution of power struggle,

governments may be compelled to successfully implement transferred policies to tackle specific challenges from other developing countries as cost-effective measures with higher guarantees of success for their affinity. It is proved that the exchange of information for the successful development of the state, as well as its processes and tools, can become an important political and institutional phenomenon for strengthening cooperation between independent states throughout the entire period of their development.

4. Policy transfer is present in the current political and legal instruments of public administration, often in strategic documents, as well as in regulatory legal acts at the federal and regional levels. However, policy selection and adaptation is carried in the absence of determined legal instruments and often within the framework of state institutions with specific tasks, as well as according to the personal opinions and preferences of government officials. As for their actual implementation, government agencies often lack specialized tools at federal and regional levels. Based on the examples of Russia and Mexico, is theoretically possible to adopt some features of federal systems for the successful formation and implementation of transferred policies today. For instance, increased presidential powers may ease the selection and adaptation of foreign policies on national strategies regarding the interactions of regional and federal organs and their power distribution accordingly.

5. A standardized approach to the selection and implementation of policy transfer based on the features of federal systems as political, legal, regulatory, budgetary, and other administrative elements, processes, and tools can appropriately address the challenges of state development. A unified approach to policy transfer helps to monitor their development and quickly identify trends, adjust strategies and offer authorities with new methods and tools for the successful development of the state. It was determined that current practice of selecting and implementing foreign policies date back to the early post-Cold War era, when the experience of development countries was unacknowledged. However, based on current regionalization trends, characterized by the emergence of independent states in their

quest for novel state development practices, the prospects of policy transfer become increasingly relevant.

6. It was determined that a successful policy transfer between Russia and Mexico can contribute to the development of public services, security policy, science, technology and education, as well as social spheres, including culture. The possibilities of implementing strategic policies within the framework of asymmetric and symmetrical federalism and its impact on the distribution of powers and budgetary measures are also noted. However, due to its holistic nature, it was determined that there is a need to create a special commission under the President of each country, based on their current powers to select and implement, as well as to monitor transferred policies, while able to make recommendations on their necessary adjustments. The commission can actively cooperate with foreign governments and become a key resource in promoting a wider distribution of global power in various regions.

Theoretical applications of the research. The main provisions and conclusion of this research provide new insights to the analysis of policy transfer with applications in the fields of political science, public policy and state management.

The new approaches proposed aim to expand the understanding of the conceptual foundations of policy transfer in the contemporary state and predict its outcomes as well as to identify new development trends based on the federal system of nations.

Practical applications of the research. Research materials, as well as empirical data introduced into scientific circulation, may be of considerable interest to government organs in implementing and adapting transferred policies as well as scientific and other analytical institutes in monitoring their performance.

The research materials can be used when reading training courses in the fields of "Political Science", "Political Management", "Public and Municipal Administration".

Research approval process. The main results of this dissertation were published in scientific journals recommended by the Higher Attestation Commission of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation.

Structure and volume of the dissertation. The dissertation consists of an introduction, three chapters (six paragraphs) and a conclusion at 144 pages. The bibliography is composed of 120 sources, including legal documents from Russia and Mexico, academic literature in Russian, Spanish and English languages as well as other internet sources.