

**EZHOVA Marina Yurevna**

**CITIZENSHIP AND FORMATION OF CIVIL IDENTITY IN POST-  
SOVIET RUSSIA AND TAJIKISTAN  
(COMPARATIVE POLITICAL AND LEGAL ANALYSIS)**

**Specialty 23.00.02 - Political institutions, processes and technologies**



**ABSTRACT OF DISSERTATION**

for the degree of  
Doctors of Politic Sciences

Moscow, 2019

Relevance of the topic of dissertation research.

The study of issues of civic identity in close connection with the institution of citizenship is particularly relevant within the framework of political science, as the sustainability of State and social institutions is clearly dependent on the position of citizens, their political activism, responsibility and tolerance.

According to authoritative experts, discourse around the bearing structures of the modern world order, its key concept - nation, state, citizenship, identity are given various, sometimes poorly compatible values, which makes problematic the political analysis of social transformations in the post-Soviet space and "turns out to be a serious theoretical and methodological challenge to social sciences, creates serious difficulties of solving the central project - formation of a civil nation and strengthening of the state civil identity."

After the collapse of the Soviet Union, the construction of new statehood by the former union republics followed various paths, but some of the new states maintained close political and economic ties with Russia.

The processes of national development in the Republic of Tajikistan are of particular interest primarily for geopolitical reasons. Russia's presence in Tajikistan is a matter of national security, leaving Tajikistan predictably will lead to the "Afghanization" of the region and complete the formation of a "belt of instability" around Russia. The preservation and consistent development of strategic partnership between our States require deep knowledge of the country, its people, the existence of ethnic, religious, territorial and civil identities of citizens, the chosen path of development and the construction of social institutions, including the institution of citizenship. The latter is particularly relevant, since Tajikistan is the only country with which the Russian Federation has concluded and ratified the Treaty on Dual Citizenship. It is a unique practice with no analogues in the post-Soviet space. Dual citizenship contributes to the preservation and strengthening of friendly ties between States and the formation of pro-Russian "influence groups" in Tajikistan. On the other hand, there has been little study of the civil identity of the biphathrides. Who are these people, how integrated are they in Russian society, what basic values are they guided by, are they capable of dialogue with other cultures?

In addition, Tajikistan has the second largest number of migrants in the Russian Federation. In relation to Russia, they are people of another civilization, with other cultural characteristics and religious practices, who have objective difficulties with integration. From the totality of emerging theoretical and applied problems, the thesis prioritized the problem of citizenship and the connection of citizenship to civic identity based on the understanding of citizenship as the object of interest of political and legal science, Ties and the role of citizenship and civic identity as the basic consolidating foundation of society and stability of the state.

In theoretical terms, the comparison of countries that solve similar problems, primarily related to security and manageability, but differing in several basic bases, makes it possible to better understand the specifics of citizenship and civic identity policies in each of them.

Working on the topic, the author based on the obvious need to develop a political and philosophical basis for interdisciplinary synthesis, which allowed to offer an understanding of the basic definitions of citizenship and identity theory acceptable to representatives of different branches of humanitarian knowledge. The justification of the idea of the need to design civil identity based on the institution of citizenship develops the logic of pragmatism in science, which is extremely relevant in connection with the incomplete processes of structuring public systems and the formation of statehood in the Russian Federation and the Republic of Tajikistan.

Degree of scientific development of the topic.

Despite a large number of publications examining citizenship and civic identity, issues of the interrelationship and interdependence of citizenship and civic identity have not received proper coverage in domestic literature. The most substantive problems of civil identity are dealt with by representatives of the Russian political science school: T.A. Alekseeva, V.G. Baranovsky, E.J. Batalov, T.M. Bromotov, O.V. Gaman-Golutvinova, Y.D. Dubrovin, A.G. Sizomissof, E.S. Zinoviev, M.V. Ilin, A.A. Kokoshin, V.S. Komarovskiy, V.V. Lapkin, M.M. Lebedeva, M.M.

Mchedlova, A.I. Nikitin, O.G. Ovcharov, E.A. Payne, V.I. Pantin, A.Y. Polunov, S.V. Patrushev, T.B. Ryabova, I.S. Semisenko, L.V. Smorgunov, A.I. Solovyev, V.A. Tishkov, A.V. Torkunov, N.N. Fedotov, A.A. Changyshev, O.F. Shabrov, E.B. Shestonal.

In Western legal and political literature, as well as in some Russian works, the problems of citizenship and civil identity are investigated in relation to migration processes, which is quite natural, as citizenship policy is one of the most important components of migration policy, today not only domestic political, but many macro-political processes are due to the scale and nature of migration. The political aspects of migration processes are explored in the works of M. Bommes, P. Buchanan, D. Jakobson, A. Maganyi, R. Penninx, F. Radke, X. Rassmussen, M. Walzer, Yu Feldhoff. Among the Russian researchers of migration processes and migration policy are A.G. Višniewski, O.D. Vorobiev, G.G. Goldin, A.G. Grishanov, J.A. Zayonchkovskaya, N.N. Zinchenko, V.S. Malakhov, V.I. Mukomel.

The diffusion of Soviet and Russian value-sense systems during the transition period caused problems of political socialization and a crisis of civic identity.

Theoretical approaches to problems of social and cultural identification are widely developed in classical philosophy and sociology (M. Weber, F. Giddings, E. Durkheim, A. Kettle, K. Marx, S. Frade, etc.). Modern scientific thought is characterized by a paradigm approach, the most striking representatives of which are: P. Bourdieu, R. Budon, R. Bart, T. Lukman, K. Mannheim, R. Merton, T. Parsons, P. Riker, P. Sorokin, E. Fromm, M. Fuko, F. Fukuyama. The development of problems of social and cultural identity was carried out by A. G. Sizomusov, S. N. Ikonnikov, I. S. Kon, A. I. Kovalev, N. N. Kozlov, V. A. Lukov, V. I. Chuprov. Religious identity was studied in the works of A.S. Agajanyan, A.S. Buryanova, M. Vorobyeva, A. Krasnikova, A. Krylov, M. Mchedlova, A. Khwyly-Olinter.

Despite the urgent need for scientific theoretical and practical reflection on the past stage of independent State construction, Tajik science lacks a constructive analysis of the institution of citizenship and civil identity in the context of transformational processes of social and political structure, a change of ideological paradigm, strategic goals and guidelines of State development.

The analysis of the available theoretical and empirical basis of the study topic concludes that the substantially significant political-philosophical meanings that form the value view of civic identity remain unsolved. The Institute of Citizenship, despite the existence of fundamental legal works, has not been fully studied in the field of political functionalism in the context of the State strategy for achieving sustainable development, inter-ethnic peace and harmony.

The aim of the study is to develop a political and legal approach to the analysis of citizenship, taking into account the peculiarities of the post-Soviet space and the relationship with civil identity, and on this basis to carry out a comparative analysis of the processes of citizenship formation and formation of civil identity in Russia and Tajikistan, their impact on the stability of the state and consolidation of society; Develop practical recommendations to optimize these processes.

Research problems:

1. To analyse nationality as category of political and legal (legal) science, to reveal the general and special in approaches of two sciences.
2. To study the essential properties of the phenomenon of identity, to determine the initial methodological principles of its analysis as a complex socio-political phenomenon.
3. To identify the relationship between mechanisms and approaches of identity formation with the main priorities of domestic and foreign policy of Russia and Tajikistan.
4. To reveal the interrelationship and interdependence of the process of citizenship formation, civic nation and civic identity.
5. To reveal the specifics, historical and sociocultural peculiarities of the formation of citizenship and the formation of civil identity in Russian and Tajik political practice.
6. To define the role of the political context in the process of citizenship formation and transformation.

7. To identify the importance of primary forms of personal identification: to show the role of religious and ethnic identity in the processes of design and transformation of civic identity.

8. To identify the role of responsible (full) citizenship and civic identity in the consolidation of society and the stability of the State.

9. Analyse the political and legal characteristics of the situation of migrants in the host country, the possibilities and problems of forming their civic identity.

10. To carry out a comparative legal analysis of the legislation on citizenship of Russia and Tajikistan and propose political and legal mechanisms to increase its effectiveness, identifying common features and specific features.

The object of the study is citizenship and civil identity in Russia and Tajikistan.

The subject of the study is the processes and factors of citizenship and civic identity formation.

Hypothesis of the study: In the modern world, citizenship ceases to be exclusively a legal category, but is filled with various political meanings, which predeterminates the variability of the connection between citizenship and civil identity. This relationship is fully realized only in the responsible full type of citizenship. The problems and difficulties of Russia and Tajikistan in the field of national construction, achievement of stable functioning of society and the state, formation of citizenship and civil identity are due not only to the legal imperfections of the measures involved, but also to the policy in the relevant sphere, objective conditions, which initially set a vector of both similarities and differences of approaches and practices in solving the emerging problems.

The theoretical and methodological basis of the study is a set of concepts and approaches, which considers the essence of the concepts of citizenship and civil identity, the factors that led to their formation and transformation. The methodological basis of the study is an interdisciplinary approach, which allowed to use theoretical provisions of both political science and other sciences, first of all, jurisprudence, philosophy, sociology and psychology.

The empirical basis of the study is based on the results of social studies conducted under the guidance of the author:

1. "Migration installations of Tajik youth" (2012-2014) All territorial and administrative units of the Republic of Tajikistan investigated the transformation of the social structure of the population, changes in value narratives, characteristics of migration patterns, their sustainability and orientation, assessed the integration potential of Tajik youth oriented towards moving to Russia, civil value preferences of young people, interests and motives of civil behavior. The main social parameters were taken into account: age, education, profession. It is interviewed 1500 человек. Selection quote stratified.

2. "Tajikistan in the modern information space" (2013) The preferences of Tajikistan in choosing mass media, influence of official mass media on formation of values and civic values were investigated. Special attention was paid to cyberspace. 1500 people are interviewed. Quote selection. 3. Education in Tajikistan: realities, problems, prospects (2014-2015). The aim of the study was to analyze public opinion on the quality of educational services in Tajikistan, assess the potential resources of educational institutions in the formation of civic identity, citizenship and patriotism of young people, skills of conscious and constructive civic behavior. 628 people are interviewed. Random sampling.

4. "Religious and National: Choosing a Value Paradigm" (2016) Young people 's views on the role of religion in modern Tajik society, the influence of religion on social and political development and processes of social and political modernization) were studied. 500 people are interviewed. Quote selection.

Statistical materials of the State Committee of the Russian Federation, materials of sociological research of the WMTOM, the Public Opinion Foundation, ISPI RAS, Levada-Center were also used. (2000-2019).

Scientific novelty of a research:

1. Unlike the absolute majority of studies dealing with citizenship issues exclusively within the framework of legal or political science, convergence of approaches has been implemented and a new political and legal paradigm of analysis of the institution of citizenship as an independent category of political science has been proposed.

2. The main theoretical and methodological approaches to the problem of citizenship are scientifically generalized, models, types and parameters of citizenship are critically studied, author's typology of citizenship is proposed, based on the real level of inclusion of the individual in the political space.

3. The essential properties of civil identity have been clarified, which has made it possible to consider civil identity as a phenomenon generated by the functioning of the political and social system, on the one hand, and a condition for the stable functioning of society and the State, on the other.

4. Theoretically justified, analytically (on the example of Russia and Tajikistan) proved and characterized the connection of the institution of citizenship and formation of civil identity.

5. For the first time, the objectives of the State strategy for inter-ethnic development were considered through the lens of normative activities in the field of citizenship, which is a structuring element of the process of formation of a civil nation.

6. It has been proven that the effectiveness of the formation of civic identity is due to the set of institutional mechanisms that ensure the selection of management methods and scenarios.

7. The essence of the connection of state policy in the sphere of granting citizenship and formation of civil identity with the purposes of protection of national interests, security is described; Unity, integrity and stability of the State as the main task at a certain stage of historical development.

8. Multilevel links between processes of political socialization and formation of ethnic, religious and civil identity are opened. The conditions and factors under which ethnic and religious identity can be combined with, rather than counter, civil identity are described.

9. For the first time, a comprehensive analysis of the general universal and specific national trends in the establishment of the institution of citizenship of Russia and Tajikistan, certain aspects of national legal systems, identification of their general and distinctive properties, peculiarities of law enforcement, as well as a political analysis of the geopolitical context of the development of independent statehood, the design of models and principles of national-state construction of Tajikistan was carried out.

10. The reasons and conditions are described, because of which the identity of migrants is not formed according to the model of a new civil identity, but retains the old or transforms into archaic forms, the problem of political and legal status and identity of bipatrides is marked.

11. Conceptual ideas and concrete recommendations have been developed and justified, which make it possible to improve the policy in the field of granting citizenship and formation of identity, which together represent a theoretical model for the construction of a unified system of legislation on citizenship, multi-nationality and migration, and recommendations have been developed to strengthen the legal, organizational and managerial foundations for the development of identity and citizenship.

Provisions for protection:

1. Citizenship is one of the key concepts of modern political existence, assuming not only a formal - legal, but also a meaningful, value-sense aspect of the relationship between the individual and the political community, expressed in awareness and acceptance of their belonging to the nation-State. Citizenship is a specific-historical form of connection with civic identity, which in democratic discourse is interpreted primarily as belonging to civil society.

2. The essential characteristics of citizenship are transformed depending on the integrative social status of a person or group, which allows to highlight the main parameters of citizenship: legal (formal) and socio-political (objective), reflecting the real level of inclusion in political space and interaction with social institutions.

In relation to the objectives of the study, the most adequately political meaning of citizenship is revealed by the typology of citizenship proposed by the author:

- Responsible nationality;
- Derelict or transit (forced acceptance of citizenship of this State due to lack of access to another),
- Passive-Comformist (distanced from political participation focused on social behaviour that is recipient to the State);
- Destructive-aggressive (legalization in the country for extremist and terrorist activities).

The relationship between citizenship and civic identity is not linear. Most closely, civic identity is correlated with responsible (according to the terminology of other authors by full citizenship).

3. At the same time, the author assumes that the specific content of the category civil identity has its specificity in different types of societies. In Russia, civil identity is de facto state-civil, which is due not only to the initial stage of the formation of a civil nation in the country, but also to the special role of the state in Russian society, the power-centric nature of this society. In the case of Tajikistan, the question of the formation of a civil nation and civil identity in the full sense of the word is not worth it, as the formation of a nation takes place according to an ethnic model.

4. Through the institution of citizenship, a unified political community is formed and established, individuals are identified as their members or foreigners, and the legal basis for a differentiated approach to them is established. On the basis of the proposed concept of citizenship, the principle of equality and recognition of a person as a subject of public power relations is based on the provision that the essence of citizenship is not only political rights, but a conceptual definition of a person as an accomplice to the exercise of political power.

5. In modern politics, citizenship is necessary not only for the internal structuring of society, but also for the implementation of foreign policy strategies. The Institute of Dual Citizenship is effective in solving foreign policy problems: maintaining presence in non-controlled territories, legitimizing interaction with "unrecognized" states, resolving ethnopolitical conflicts, social protection of compatriots. However, the issue of the formation of the civil identity of the bipatrides has hardly been studied.

6. Civic identity is shaped partly spontaneously, partly purposefully. The aims and mechanisms of civic identity formation are aimed at the actual acceptance and progressive transformation by the individual of the various proposed scenarios of his or her political and sociocultural existence in the State; Promote the mastery of the subject in real political space, manifested in the ability to exercise political rights on the basis of its own or proposed standard and its sign-symbolic embodiment.

7. Despite the essential differences in the processes of formation of civil identity in Russia and Tajikistan, the policy of strategic partnership, integration and maintenance of a single political and legal space requires synchronization of national legislation on citizenship and migration. The basis of special perception of bilateral relations between Russia and Tajikistan is geopolitical factor focused on threats to security. Geopolitical threats to sovereignty - Terrorism and religious extremism exported from Afghanistan, Iraq and Syria have led to the specificity of citizenship legislation, especially the deliberate withdrawal of guarantees for stateless persons, refugees, asylum-seekers and the possibility of deprivation of citizenship for participation in terrorist organizations.

8. In today 's world, the structure of symbolic spaces within which ideas and identity are formed and competed is deformed by large-scale migration processes. Social mobility, globalization processes and the dynamic development of communication technologies lead to increased subjectivity in identifying individuals with real and virtual groups. Migrants are carriers and distributors not only of their own ethical and religious norms, but also of legal perceptions. The processes of identity formation take place in a different matrix than in autochthonous residents

of the country, which requires appropriate adjustments to the analytical tools used, in particular the combination of civil, ethnic and religious identity.

Theoretical and practical significance of the work. The convergence of the political and legal approach to the analysis of citizenship has made it possible to propose a political interpretation of the phenomenon of citizenship and, from these positions, to develop typologies of citizenship and its relationship to the formation of civil identity. Based on the systematic approach, a comprehensive analysis of the legislation on citizenship of Russia and Tajikistan has been carried out, conclusions have been justified and concrete recommendations have been developed to improve the existing legal and regulatory framework for this area. The phenomenon of civil identity has been studied in the context of multi-vector geopolitical trends, specifics of socio-political development of transitional societies, the main observations and conclusions have a wide range of applications in the process of formation of civil identity and civil society as a whole.

The provisions of the thesis can be used in the development of a complex political, as well as inter-standard theory of civil identity, principles and mechanisms of its formation, for updating the categorical-conceptual apparatus of the humanities. The recommendations and proposals will be useful in the development of the conceptual framework of State legal policy, first of all, legislation on citizenship and migration, comprehensive targeted programmes and projects within the framework of identity policy for the formation of citizenship and patriotism, principles of conflict-free interaction and inter-ethnic harmony between the peoples of Russia and Tajikistan.

The materials of the study can also be used in education for the preparation of training courses, in the creation of scientific and methodological programs and teaching aids, in educational and social work, in the development of skills of employees of legislative, executive power, local self-government bodies, in the development of concepts of political parties and public associations.

Testing and implementation of results of dissertation research. The main provisions of the dissertation study were reflected in publications and monographs: articles in leading Russian, Tajik and international publications, theses of reports at conferences and seminars, as well as in scientific and methodological works and educational collections, the total volume of publications of more than 40 printed sheets.

The main provisions and conclusions of the dissertation study were used by the author in the preparation of the author's courses "Migration Policy of the Russian Federation," Ethnic Policy of the Russian Federation, "Eurasian Policy of the Russian Federation," Foundations of Consular Service, "Modernization and Transformation Processes in the Central Asian Region," etc.

The structure of the thesis is determined by its purpose, tasks, object, subject, logic of political analysis of the studied problems. The work consists of an introduction, four chapters, 13 paragraphs, an opinion, a list of parameters and sources used in the work.