

FEDERAL STATE BUDGETARY EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION OF
HIGHER EDUCATION
RUSSIAN PRESIDENTIAL ACADEMY OF NATIONAL ECONOMY AND
PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

NIZHNY NOVGOROD INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT

Manuscript copyright


Karen V. DODONOV

**THEORY AND PRACTICE OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE
PRINCIPLES OF ENVIRONMENTAL LAW
IN THE LEGAL SYSTEM OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION**

Specialization 5.1.2. Public Law (State-Legal) Sciences

ABSTRACT

of the Dissertation Submitted for the Degree of Candidate of Legal Sciences

Academic Supervisor:
Vera A. Ilyukhina,
Doctor of Legal Sciences,
associate professor

Nizhny Novgorod – 2026

Relevance of the Research Topic. Addressing environmental challenges is not merely one of the most pertinent but rather one of the most critical tasks facing the global community as a whole and each individual state in particular, including the Russian Federation. The effective resolution of these challenges in Russia directly depends on the quality of domestic environmental legislation and the proper organization of its practical implementation.

In turn, any normative legal act, any body of such acts, the legal regulation of a specific sphere of social relations, and the legal system as a whole are founded upon certain fundamental ideas, or principles of law. The effectiveness of the application of legal norms is conditioned by the alignment of these ideas with the needs of society and the state, historical traditions and national values, the requirements of legislative drafting, as well as the clarity of their formulation and their intelligibility to the subjects of legal relations. This applies fully to the environmental sphere of social relations.

Regrettably, the methodological situation surrounding the study of the principles of law within contemporary legal scholarship is extremely convoluted and has even been characterized as a "methodological-cognitive collapse"¹. With regard to the principles of environmental law, this situation is further complicated by the fact that, unlike several other branches of Russian law, environmental law has not been codified. Although Federal Law No. 7-FZ of January 10, 2002, "On Environmental Protection" serves as the fundamental normative legal act in the environmental sphere and functionally operates as a codified instrument, it nevertheless falls significantly short, in terms of the breadth and depth of its regulation of social relations, of the codes in force in other branches of Russian law (criminal, civil, criminal procedure, civil procedure, penal enforcement, family, labor, etc.).

A number of issues concerning the concept of environmental law and its structure remain debatable. This gives rise to difficulties in understanding the

¹ See: Ilyukhina, V.A. Principles of Law in the National Legal Systems of the Russian Federation and the Republic of Armenia (A Comparative Legal Study), ed. by A.A. Demichev. Moscow: Direct-Media, 2024, p. 10.

system of principles of environmental law, their role in the legal regulation of social relations pertaining to natural resource use, environmental protection, and the ensuring of environmental safety, as well as the role of the principles of environmental law within the legal system of the Russian Federation.

The dynamic nature of environmental legislation necessitates its adjustment in light of modern realities. This is particularly important in the context of ambiguous comprehension and interpretation of the principles of environmental law in law enforcement practice. It should also be noted that, in view of the fact that in May 2021 the Chairwoman of the Federation Council of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation, V.I. Matvienko, officially put forward an initiative to draft an Environmental Code², and given that, under the rules of modern legislative drafting, an integral component of any codified instrument is a structural element devoted to the principles of law, the study of the principles of environmental law currently possesses not only scholarly and theoretical relevance but also acquires a high degree of practical significance. However, scholarly research into the fundamental principles of environmental law is necessary not only in light of the potential prospects for developing a new draft Environmental Code of the Russian Federation but, above all, because at present there is an acute need to ensure a consolidated theoretical approach to the formulation and interpretation of the principles of environmental law in environmental legal doctrine and in law enforcement practice—something that is currently lacking.

Extent of Scholarly Elaboration of the Scientific Problem. In the legal literature, the problem of the principles of environmental law has not escaped the attention of researchers.

At the monograph level, it has been examined twice: first by M.M. Brinchuk³, and shortly thereafter by A.Ya. Ryzhenkov⁴. The contentious nature of

² See: V. Matvienko Put Forward an Initiative to Draft an Environmental Code // URL: <https://www.ecocongress.info/presscenter/news/v-matvienko-vystupila-s-initsiativoy-sozdaniya-ekologicheskogo-kodeksa/> (accessed: November 10, 2025).

³ See: Brinchuk, M.M. Principles of Environmental Law: A Monograph. Moscow: Yurlitinform, 2013.

the concept and system of environmental law has also influenced the approaches to studying the principles of this branch. Despite the identical titles of the works by M.M. Brinchuk and A.Ya. Ryzhenkov, their substance proved to be entirely different. The first of the aforementioned authors adopted an exceptionally broad approach to understanding the principles of environmental law, briefly characterizing: the principles of state environmental policy; the principles of environmental law as a complex branch; the principles of international environmental law; the principles of natural resource law; the principles of individual institutions of environmental law; the principles (rules) of environmental lawmaking; and the principles of state administration of natural resource use and environmental protection. In contrast to M.M. Brinchuk, A.Ya. Ryzhenkov examines individual principles of environmental law in greater depth, though doing so only through the lens of interbranch and branch principles of environmental law. At the same time, he also characterizes certain institutional principles—the set of which does not substantially overlap with those examined by M.M. Brinchuk—and raises the issue of doctrinal principles of environmental law.

It should be noted that the study of the principles of land law was the subject of a doctoral dissertation by G.A. Volkov⁵, the principle of payment for land use—of a candidate's dissertation by A.V. Khotko⁶, and the principle of rational natural resource use—of a candidate's dissertation by M.V. Makhrova⁷.

In a number of individual⁸ and collective monographs⁹, as well as in dissertation research¹⁰, alongside other pertinent issues of environmental law,

⁴ See: Ryzhenkov, A.Ya. *Principles of Environmental Law: A Monograph*. Moscow: Yurlitinform, 2018.

⁵ See: Volkov, G.A. *Principles of Land Law: Abstract of Doctoral Dissertation (Law)*. Moscow, 2005. See also: Volkov, G.A. *Principles of Land Law*. Moscow: Gorodets, 2005.

⁶ See: Khotko, A.V. *The Principle of Payment for Land Use: Implementation in Land Legislation and Law Enforcement Practice: Abstract of Candidate's Dissertation (Law)*. Moscow, 2014.

⁷ See: Makhrova, M.V. *Rational Natural Resource Use as a Principle of Environmental Law: Candidate's Dissertation (Law)*. Orenburg, 1999.

⁸ See: Petrova, T.V. *Legal Problems of the Economic Mechanism of Environmental Protection*. Moscow: Zertsalo, 2000; Vasilyeva, M.I. *Public Interests in Environmental Law*. Moscow: Moscow State University Press, 2003; Broslavsky, L.I. *Liability for the Environment and Compensation for Environmental Harm: Laws and Realities in Russia, the United States, and the European Union: A Monograph*. Moscow: INFRA-M, 2014; Dubovik, O.L. *Environmental Law of Eastern European Countries: A Monograph*. Moscow: Institute of State and Law of the Russian Academy of Sciences, 2018;

certain aspects of the problem of the principles of environmental law have also been addressed.

Furthermore, the principles of environmental law in general, or individual principles thereof, have been the subject of articles by M.U. Abukarova, A.P. Anisimov, N.D. Vershilo, V.A. Gabrielyan, A.R. Gayfullina, R. Kh. Gizzatullin, A. Zhelezinskiy, K. Kh. Ibragimov, S.V. Ivanova, V.A. Ilyukhina, E.V. Maryin, V.G. Melnikov, M.M. Mukhlynina, A.Ya. Ryzhenkov, V.P. Cherdantsev, and others.

In modern legal science, there exist studies (both in the form of monographs and individual articles) on the principles of environmental law conducted on the basis of the materials of other states, for example, Belarus (I.L. Vershok, T.I. Makarova, A.V. Sleptsov, I.S. Shakhray), Bulgaria (G. Penchev), Kyrgyzstan (Zh.T. Murzabekova), China (M.M. Brinchuk), Lithuania (A. Andruškevičius, A. Marcijonas), Ukraine (L.L. Chausova), Japan (V.S. Khizhnyak), the countries of Eastern Europe (O.L. Dubovik), and the European Union (M.M. Brinchuk) as a whole. Furthermore, it should be noted that research on the principles of environmental law has also been conducted from a comparative perspective. Comparisons have been made with the principles of environmental law of Belarus, Germany, China, Slovakia, the United States, and other states (A.P. Anisimov,

Brinchuk, M.M. *The Constitution and Environmental Law: A Monograph*. Moscow: Institute of State and Law of the Russian Academy of Sciences, 2019; Bogolyubov, S.A. *Current Issues of Environmental Law: A Monograph*. Moscow: Yurayt, 2024.

⁹ See: *Legal Liability for Environmental Offenses* / ed. By O.L. Dubovik. Moscow: Institute of State and Law of the Russian Academy of Sciences, 2012; *Legal and Individual Regulation of Natural Resource Relations: A Collective Monograph* / ed. By V.N. Vlasenko, I.O. Krasnova. Moscow: Russian State University of Justice, 2021; *Legal Mechanism for Ensuring the Rational Use of Natural Resources: A Monograph*, ed. By E.A. Galinovskaya. Moscow: Institute of Legislation and Comparative Law under the Government of the Russian Federation: INFRA-M, 2022.

¹⁰ See, e.g., Golichenkov, A.K. *Environmental Control: Theory and Practice of Legal Regulation: Doctoral Dissertation (Law)*. Moscow, 1992; Anisimov, A.P. *The Human and Civil Right to a Favorable Environment in the Russian Federation: Constitutional and Legal Aspects: Candidate's Dissertation (Law)*. Volgograd, 1997; Velieva, D.S. *Constitutional and Legal Issues of the Implementation of the Human and Civil Right to a Favorable Environment in Russia: Candidate's Dissertation (Law)*. Saratov, 2001; Ivanova, S.V. *Legal Framework for State Administration in the Field of Protection and Use of Fauna: Doctoral Dissertation (Law)*. Moscow, 2021; Luneva, E.V. *The Right to Rational Natural Resource Use: Doctrine, Methodology, and Practice: Doctoral Dissertation (Law)*. Kazan, 2023.

V.A. Vinogradov, T.V. Vukolova, Liu Huang Yan, Ma Xin, L.V. Soldatova, and others).

In general, despite a certain degree of scholarly attention having been devoted to the principles of environmental law, no studies conducted strictly within the framework of positivist methodology have yet appeared in the academic literature: there has been no multidimensional definition of the principles of this branch of law taking into account its specific characteristics; the principles of environmental law have not been classified according to the source of their embodiment; no special attention has been paid to the system of principles of environmental law, including the role of constitutional principles therein; and, based on a comprehensive analysis of the judicial practice of the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation, the Supreme Court of the Russian Federation, commercial courts, courts of general jurisdiction, and magistrates, no attempt has been made to ascertain the role of specific principles of environmental law in the Russian legal system.

Purpose and Objectives of the Study. The purpose of the dissertation research is to identify the theoretical and practical role of the principles of environmental law in the legal system of the Russian Federation.

To achieve this purpose, the dissertation research addresses the following set of interrelated objectives:

- to formulate, based on a positivist understanding of law, the concept of the principles of environmental law and to identify their specific characteristics;
- to classify the principles of environmental law according to the source of their normative embodiment, with the aim of facilitating the law enforcer's understanding of the correlation between the legal force of different principles and determining the place of each specific principle within the system of principles of environmental law;
- to identify and characterize the system of principles of environmental law of the Russian Federation, including establishing the rules of their hierarchy within the system;

- to determine the theoretical and practical role of constitutional principles of environmental law within the system of principles of environmental law and within the national legal system of the Russian Federation;

- to characterize the principles of environmental law embodied in Federal Law No. 7-FZ of January 10, 2002, "On Environmental Protection" and to establish their role and practical significance within the system of principles of environmental law;

- based on an analysis of current legislation, law enforcement practice, and academic literature, to formulate scientifically grounded proposals for adjusting the wording and content of individual principles of environmental law, as well as for improving Article 3 of Federal Law "On Environmental Protection" as a whole.

Object and Subject of the Study. The object of the study comprises the principles of environmental law as normatively embodied fundamental ideas of the branch of Russian environmental law. The object of the study does not include the principles of natural resource legislation (with the exception of constitutional principles and the principles formulated in Article 3 of Federal Law No. 7-FZ of January 10, 2002, "On Environmental Protection"), since they have already been, or may in the future be, the object of specialized research. Furthermore, the principles of international environmental law are not included within the object of the study, as their examination falls outside the scope of Specialization 5.1.2, under which the present dissertation research is submitted for defense.

Subject of the Study. The subject of the study comprises the normative legal acts of the Russian Federation in which the principles of environmental law are normatively embodied, as well as materials of judicial practice through which the principles of environmental law are implemented.

Theoretical and Methodological Framework of the Study. The theoretical framework of the study is formed by the works of Russian and foreign specialists in the field of theoretical and practical issues of environmental law (O.K. Alieva, A.P. Anisimov, S.A. Bogolyubov, M.M. Brinchuk, M.I. Vasilyeva, D.S. Velieva, G.A. Volkov, T.V. Vukolova, A.K. Golichenkov, O.L. Dubovik, B.V. Erofeev,

S.V. Ivanova, T.A. Ignatieva, O.S. Kolbasov, L.E. Korobka, O.I. Krassov, M.V. Makhrova, F.P. Rumyantsev, Ma Xin, V.V. Petrov, T.V. Petrova, A.Ya. Ryzhenkov, I.S. Shakhray, and others), as well as the works of scholars who have addressed general theoretical and branch-specific issues of the principles of law and studied questions of the legal system (S.S. Alekseev, N.M. Vagina, R. Gosalbo Bono, R. Dworkin, A.A. Demichev, S.D. Dmitriev, V.V. Ershov, A.L. Zakharov, K.S. Zakharova, V.A. Ilyukhina, T. Cancoreli, D.A. Kerimov, O.A. Kuznetsova, A.V. Konovalov, S. Yu. Lavrus, G.M. Lanova, S.V. Mazurenko, A.V. Malko, N.I. Matuzov, S.A. Mosin, V.V. Oksamytny, R. Poscher, J. Raz, E.V. Skurko, A.V. Smirnova, Ya. Stoilov, O.E. Surkova, Yu.A. Tikhomirov, S.E. Frolov, H.L.A. Hart, L.S. Yavich, and others).

The methodological framework of the study consists of a combination of general scientific methods of cognition (analysis and synthesis, induction and deduction, generalization and ascent from the abstract to the concrete, modeling, formalization, concretization, and others) and specific legal methods. Among the specific legal methods, a significant role is played by the formal-dogmatic method, which made it possible to identify the principles of environmental law from the body of normative legal acts, and the method of legal interpretation, through which the content of the principles of environmental law was ascertained. The method of classification made it possible, taking into account the specific characteristics of the branch of environmental law, to classify the principles of environmental law according to various criteria. The system-structural method made it possible to characterize the system of principles of environmental law and to determine their place within the Russian legal system. In analyzing judicial practice, the method of content analysis was employed, which allowed for the ascertainment of the frequency with which each specific principle of environmental law is actually used by courts in the reasoning of the judicial acts they issue.

In combination, the use of these methodological tools enabled a study of the principles of environmental law within the legal system of the Russian Federation.

Information Base of the Study. The information base of the work, taking into account the subject of the study, consists of the current normative legal acts of the Russian Federation in which the principles of environmental law are embodied. Among these, the greatest significance attaches to the Constitution of the Russian Federation; Federal Law No. 7-FZ of January 10, 2002, "On Environmental Protection"; Land Code of the Russian Federation No. 136-FZ of October 25, 2001; Water Code of the Russian Federation No. 74-FZ of June 3, 2006; Forest Code of the Russian Federation No. 200-FZ of December 4, 2006; Federal Law No. 52-FZ of April 24, 1995, "On Fauna"; Federal Law No. 89-FZ of June 24, 1998, "On Production and Consumption Waste"; Federal Law No. 96-FZ of May 4, 1999, "On Protection of Atmospheric Air"; and others. In addition, certain normative legal acts that have become invalid were used, for example, the RSFSR Law No. 2060-1 of December 19, 1991, "On Protection of the Natural Environment" as well as the official state (national) reports on the condition and use of land in the Russian Federation, published by Russian register for a number of years. Furthermore, for the purpose of identifying the actual role of the principles of environmental law in the Russian legal system, the information base of the study includes numerous materials of judicial practice of the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation, the Supreme Court of the Russian Federation, commercial courts, courts of general jurisdiction, and magistrates.

Validity and Reliability of the Research Results. The degree of reliability of the research results is determined by the wide range of normative legal acts and materials of judicial practice examined, the use of the works of leading specialists in the field of environmental law and legal theory, reliance on a methodology of scholarly inquiry conducive to achieving the purpose of the research and addressing its objectives, and the validity of the main propositions and conclusions of the dissertation.

Propositions Submitted for Defense and Possessing Scholarly Novelty:

1. For the first time in legal science, a definition of the principles of environmental law has been formulated. This definition is based on a positivist

understanding of law, is practice-oriented, and enables the law enforcer to form an understanding of the sources of normative embodiment and the essence of the principles of law. The principles of environmental law are the fundamental ideas in the sphere of legal regulation of social relations related to environmental protection as a whole, the protection of its individual components, and the use of natural resources, which are embodied in the Constitution of the Russian Federation, as well as explicitly marked in Federal Law "On Environmental Protection" the Land Code of the Russian Federation, the Water Code of the Russian Federation, the Forest Code of the Russian Federation, Federal Law "On Fauna" and other normative legal acts constituting environmental legislation. They constitute specific norms of law, possess imperative force for the subjects of environmental legal relations and related legal relations, and express the essence of environmental law (which corresponds to paragraph 27 of the Passport of Specialization 5.1.2).

2. The specific characteristics of the principles of environmental law that distinguish them from the principles of other branches of law have been identified: 1) in the absence of an Environmental Code of the Russian Federation, they are embodied in fifteen (apart from the Constitution of the Russian Federation) different normative legal acts; 2) the number of principles of environmental law is greater than in any other branch of Russian law; 3) the lists of principles of environmental law contained in different normative legal acts are, for the most part, open-ended; 4) within the system of principles of environmental law, specific branch principles of environmental law that are not embodied at the constitutional level predominate.

It has been established that, despite a number of distinctive features, the principles of environmental law share similar characteristics with the principles of other branches of Russian law: 1) they are fundamental ideas of a branch of law; 2) they are normatively embodied; 3) they are explicitly marked by the legislator as principles; 4) they constitute a specific type of legal norms (their structure lacks hypotheses and sanctions) and act as a direct regulator of social relations; 5) they are imperative for the subjects of legal relations; 6) they serve as a criterion and

guide for the legislator in the improvement and development of legislation; 7) they reflect the system of values and priorities existing in society and express the essence of law in a specific historical period; 8) they possess a dynamic character within the legal system (which corresponds to paragraph 27 of the Passport of Specialization 5.1.2).

3. A classification of the principles of environmental law oriented toward the law enforcer has been developed, based on the source of their embodiment, which allows for an understanding of the role of each principle in the legal system and, in part, its significance in law enforcement practice. The principles of environmental law are divided into three groups: 1) constitutional principles of law that are not duplicated in branch environmental legislation (7 principles); 2) constitutional principles of law that are duplicated and/or specified in branch environmental legislation (5 principles); 3) specific principles of environmental law that have not found expression in the Constitution of the Russian Federation and are embodied only in branch legislation (formally 116 principles) (which corresponds to paragraph 27 of the Passport of Specialization 5.1.2).

4. It has been proven that the system of principles of environmental law has a hierarchical structure and comprises three levels: 1) constitutional principles of environmental law; 2) principles of environmental law embodied in Article 3 of Federal Law "On Environmental Protection"; 3) principles of environmental law embodied in other normative legal acts constituting environmental legislation. It has been established that, in the event of a conflict between principles of law belonging to different levels, principles of a higher level unconditionally prevail, whereas a conflict between principles of the same level is to be resolved solely by the law enforcer, based on the circumstances of the particular case and the applicability of the relevant environmental normative legal act to the sphere of the relations being regulated (which corresponds to paragraph 27 of the Passport of Specialization 5.1.2).

5. It has been established that a number of provisions marked by the legislator in Article 3 of Federal Law "On Environmental Protection" as the basic

principles of environmental protection do not constitute fundamental ideas in the sphere of regulating the relations between humanity, society, and nature, i.e., principles of environmental law. Based on an analysis of environmental legislation, law enforcement practice, and scholarly literature, the author's own redraft of Article 3 of Federal Law "On Environmental Protection" is proposed (which corresponds to paragraph 27 of the Passport of Specialization 5.1.2).

Theoretical and Practical Significance of the Study. The theoretical significance of the dissertation research consists in the fact that the conclusions reached in the course of the research enrich the science of environmental law with regard to issues concerning the principles of law. In particular, the contribution to the development of the doctrine of environmental law includes:

- the proposed positivist definition of the principles of environmental law;
- the identification of the specific characteristics of the principles of environmental law;
- the classification of the principles of environmental law according to the source of their embodiment;
- the substantiation of the hierarchical nature of the system of principles of environmental law.

The practical significance of the study lies in the formulation of practical recommendations for improving the normative embodiment of the principles of law contained in Article 3 of Federal Law "On Environmental Protection".

Furthermore, the materials contained in the dissertation research are used in delivering lectures, conducting seminars, and practical classes in environmental law at the Nizhny Novgorod Institute of Management – branch of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (RANEPA).

Approbation of the Research Results. The results of the dissertation research were discussed at meetings of the Department of Constitutional and Administrative Law of the Faculty of Law of the Nizhny Novgorod Institute of

Management – branch of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration.

The main ideas of the work have been reflected in six publications by the author, including three articles in journals recommended by the Higher Attestation Commission under the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation, of which one article was published in the journal "Constitutional and Municipal Law", recommended by the Academic Council of RANEPA for the publication of articles in the field of jurisprudence. The results were also presented and discussed at the following scientific and representative events: the International Scientific and Theoretical Conference "Man and Society in Contradictions and Accord" (Nizhny Novgorod, 2024); the All-Russian Scientific and Practical Conference with International Participation "The Seventh Congress of Civil Law Scholars of Law Enforcement Agencies" (Nizhny Novgorod – Barnaul, 2025); the All-Russian Scientific and Practical Conference "Current Issues of Russian Constitutionalism" (Nizhny Novgorod, 2025); and the Sixth All-Russian Scientific Conference of Cadets, Students, Adjuncts, Postgraduates, and Doctoral Candidates "Current Issues of Legal Science through the Eyes of Young Researchers" (Ryazan, 2006).

Structure of the Dissertation. The structure of the dissertation is determined by the subject matter of the research, as well as by its purpose and objectives. The work consists of an introduction, two chapters each comprising two sections, conclusions and recommendations, a list of principal abbreviations, and a list of used sources and literature.

List of Author's Publications on the Research Topic

Publications in Peer-Reviewed Scientific Journals Recommended by the Higher Attestation Commission of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation for Publishing the Main Scientific Results of Candidate's Dissertations and Doctoral Dissertations

1. Dodonov, K.V. Constitutional Principles of Environmental Law// Constitutional and Municipal Law¹¹, 2025, No. 6, pp. 60–64.
2. Dodonov, K.V. The System of Principles of Environmental Law// Environmental Law, 2025, No. 6, pp. 29–32.
3. Dodonov, K.V. Principles of Environmental Law from the Perspective of a Positivist Understanding of Law // Legal Science and Practice: Journal of the Nizhny Novgorod Academy of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Russia, 2025, No. 4, pp. 216–223.

Other Publications

4. Dodonov, K.V. Principles of Environmental Law in Federal Law "On Environmental Protection"// Man and Society in Contradictions and Accord: Collection of Scientific Papers Based on the Materials of the International Scientific and Theoretical Conference, Nizhny Novgorod, November 21, 2024. Nizhny Novgorod: I.P. Gladkova O.V., 2024, pp. 278–282.
5. Dodonov, K.V. The Issue of Principles of Environmental Law in the Context of the Debate on the Subject and System of Environmental Law// Bulletin of the Nizhny Novgorod Institute of Management, 2025, No. 2 (76), pp. 10–21.
6. Dodonov, K.V. Problematic Aspects of Identifying the Principles of Environmental Law// The Seventh Congress of Civil Law Scholars of Law Enforcement Agencies: Proceedings of the All-Russian Scientific and Practical Conference with International Participation, Nizhny Novgorod – Barnaul, March 28, 2025. Moscow: Rusains, 2025, pp. 160–166.

¹¹ The journal is included in the List of Journals Recommended by the Academic Council of RANEPa for Publications in Jurisprudence.